

Second response to Dr. Alireza Assar Part 1

Second response to Dr. Alireza Assar

By Ali Sina

2006/03/12

Dear Dr. Sina,

It is now more than 2 weeks that I have received your answer, and only now I have found little time to reply. First of all I should emphasize right from the beginning that I have no intention to cast doubt on your educational background and academic qualifications. About myself I must tell you that I am 53 years old and so my academic background is not completely reachable through internet. My first publications in high energy physics belong to the late 1970's and for one of the recent ones you just Google Assar....momentum operators...localized massless particles.

Ok, Dr. Sina, as I have told you earlier I am a believer in God, but I am not a muslim; and so I can talk about Islam in a very comfortable manner far from any sort of prejudice. However, I still insist that what you are doing is wrong and will have negative consequences.

Suppose, just for the sake of discussion, that as you claim, the founder of Islam Mohammad-ibn abdullah was a liar, a bandit, a womanizer..., etc. But still I prove to you that he has been by far the greatest personality in the history of mankind. To this end let's move step by step.

First of all, he has been a very smart and handsome man and for this reason one of the richest and most influential ladies, Khadijah, fell in love with him, married him and devoted all her wealth to help the man in question develop his ideology, to be called Islam later. After Khadijah died, many other beautiful women tried most of them unsuccessfully, to conquer his heart, and Ayesha was one of those who succeeded in that respect. So the man in question has been very successful with women, a quality that most intelligent men do not have! I hope, Dr. Sina that so far you have no objection.

Let's go to the next step. Suppose he was a liar; ok, but then he must have been a very special liar!! Most people often lie but nobody believes them. Don't you think that it is indeed extremely strange that a man in a remote part of the world has told so many lies and still after 1400 years 1.5 billion people strongly believe in those lies? Today many politicians try to lie in any election but nobody is convinced. So you see that in this respect too the man in question has had an exceptional quality.

Let's now move to the next step. The man we are talking about has been very brave and exceptionally successful as a military commander. He took part in all battles and wars and although in some of these wars he was badly wounded, in almost all of these military efforts he was the winner!! Compare him with most famous politicians in the country you live in, and what they did when their country was at war in Vietnam !!! I can continue and go on for several pages to make you understand that the founder of Islam, whatever you may call him, has been the most successful man in the history; and to convince yourself of this fact just compare him with any other personality in history that you may consider to be important. No man has been able to influence the history and destiny of mankind as much as he has. Therefore he is to be respected or at least not to be insulted. People who believe in him love him to the extent that give their lives to defend his legacy and won't be distracted by your and similar efforts.

Best regards,

Dr. A.R. Assar

Alireza Assar assar@aon.at wrote:

Dear Dr. Sina,

I understand you ; take your time and don't hurry at all. I am also very busy in Vienna and doing all I can, as I have been doing in the past 12 years, to take the nuclear file of Mullahs to the UN security council. However, since you know that I am not a moslem and not any sort of religious fanatic, and since in particular you like to put the emails you receive on internet, please in any sort of interchange with me put all your emotions on one side and stay on the side of a calm and logical discussion. Thank you in advance; A.R.Assar

Dear Dr. Assar.

First of all let me apologize for responding so late.

You are an educated man and a man of science. Despite that you have engaged in several logical fallacies which I hope at the end you will agree with me.

You say, suppose that Mohammad was a liar, a bandit, a womanizer..., etc, but still he was by far the greatest personality in the history of mankind.

This is an oxymoron. How can a liar, a bandit and a womanizer be the greatest personality in the history of mankind? What do you mean by great personality? Was Hitler a great personality? Were Genghis Khan, Attila the Hun, Napoleon, Stalin, Mao Ze Dong, Khomeini and Saddam Hussein great personalities? Remember that these beasts too had great victories and were feared and loved by many. All of them had created a personality cult around themselves and many people adored them. You seem to have a very twisted notion of greatness. I do not consider one who kills another human being a great person.

Let us analyze your letter point by point.

Your first argument is that Khadijah, a wealthy influential woman of Arabia, fell in love with Muhammad and spent her wealth for the promotion of his cause.

In *Understanding Muhammad: A Psychobiography of Allah's Prophet*, I have analyzed Muhammad's relationship with Khadijah in detail. Here is an extract from that book.

Khadijah was a comely woman. She was the favorite daughter of her father Khuwaylid. In fact Khuwaylid relied on her, more than he relied on his sons. She was "daddy's daughter". She had rejected the hands of the powerful men of Mecca. But when she saw Muhammad, she fell in love with him on the spot and sent someone to propose marriage.

On the surface it seems that Muhammad had such a magnetic personality that mesmerized this powerful woman. This is the superficial understanding of all the Muslims. However the truth is more complex, which can only be seen by discerning eyes and by reading the biography of Muhammad critically and not credulously.

Tabari writes: "Khadija sent a message to Muhammad inviting him to take her. She called her father to her house, plied him with wine until he was drunk, anointed him with perfume, clothed him in a striped robe and slaughtered a cow. Then she sent for Muhammad and his uncles. When they came in, her father married him to her. When he recovered from his intoxication, he said, "What is this meat, this perfume, and this garment?" She replied, "You have married me to Muhammad bin Abdullah". "I have not done so," he said. "Would I do this when the greatest men of Mecca have asked for you and I have not agreed, why would I give you to a bum?" [Persian Tabari v. 3 p.832]

The party of Muhammad replied indignantly that the alliance had been arranged by his own daughter. The old man drew his sword in anger and the relatives of Muhammad drew theirs. Blood was about to be shed that Khadija made her love for Muhammad to be known and confessed to have masterminded the whole proceeding. The old man was then pacified as he realized things are no more in his hand and reconciliation ensued.